



**Workshop on “Heritage Tourism Development
at the Central Police Station Compound”**

6 February 2005

The Central Police Station Open Days held during 22-23 and 29-30 January 2005 and 5-6 February 2005 were co-organized by the Tourism Commission, the Central and Western District Council, the Hong Kong Institute of Architects and the Conservancy Association. The objective of the Open Days is to allow more people to understand the history of the compound and the current conditions of the site, and to gauge their views on the future usage of the site. There were more than 5,700 visitors during the Open Days.

As a highlight of the event, a public workshop was held on 6.2.2005 at the former Central Magistracy, with about 100 participants from the general public, interested parties and professional bodies. It provided a good opportunity for participants from different background to discuss the future usage of the site and important matters to be considered in taking forward the project. The moderator of the workshop was an independent consultant. The consultant has compiled a Workshop Summary Report (copy attached) documenting all points expressed by participants during the workshop.

The Government is carefully examining the views collected from the public in deciding the way forward.

**Tourism Commission
13 June 2005**



Unit 606, Kinwick Centre,
Central, Hong Kong
Tel: (852) 2541-2126 Fax: (852) 2541-5771
Email : info@peopleplus.com.hk
Website: www.peopleplus.com.hk

Workshop on “Heritage Tourism Development

At the Central Police Station Compound”

February 6, 2005

Workshop Summary Report

This Summary Report documents all points expressed by participants during the workshop in the following tables. The discussion focused on four major areas: 1) Future usage of site; 2) Economic vs. social benefits; 3) Financing arrangement; 4) Public participation.

Future Usage of the Site

Mixed Development/ Multi-purpose Development

- With integrated usage and not just make it for a single purpose only.
- For multi-purpose development. Public accessibility and participation are the most important issues for consideration while developing the site.
- For multi-purpose development combining the commercial element and tourism, e.g. museum with commercial elements. Shops can attract tourists.
- As multi-purpose development, e.g. Chime in Singapore, Sun-Tien-De in Shanghai.
- Develop into a place that can integrate with HK's community. It should be used for multi-purpose, with café/restaurant for local people or visitors. Some for historical purposes like a museum for education; some as art galleries/workshops for artists.
- Do not need to use all of the 17 buildings for the same purpose as a museum. Move the Police Museum on the Peak into one of the historic buildings at the site. For the rest of the historic buildings, they could be used for cultural workshop, café/restaurant or art galleries or workshops can be provided. E.g. the fringe club, being multi-purpose.
- Combine commercial and conservation purpose for tourism purpose. There is much space which can be used individually for different purposes, e.g. museum, exhibition, art gallery for individual artists. Also, it can be a café but not a restaurant. Need to preserve the site.
- Combine the creative, commercial and cultural elements. Don't just think about commercial or non-commercial issue; tourism based or heritage based. Try to develop its greatest potential by using creativity.
- Agree for recreation facilities and museum combined together. Preserve the antiques as much as possible. Not only the outlook appearance of the building.
- As museum with different themes. Each building becomes a theme museum. Combining the recreation and cultural or art exhibition. Some space can be restaurant linking SOHO and Lan Kwai Fong and make it an attractive point to tourists. Some space for public use such as exhibition or concert or gathering.
- Is there any creative idea to combine all the things, antique preservation and commercial elements?
- There are many buildings. Some as museum focusing on Hong Kong's judiciary system and history. Some as an open education area, hence we can rent out some space for education purpose. There can be shops or exhibitions to sell/show Hong Kong's cultural characteristics products like some local art products.
- Preserve and make use of the characteristics of the building, e.g. the jail for educating teenagers. And use the commercial elements as the capital resource of the site.
- If it is used for multipurpose development, it doesn't mean that putting in as many things as possible is a good way. Make it under one theme and relate to the background of the site.
- Sustainability of the site is not only about money. The site should offer different proportion for different purposes.
- Even for multi-purpose development, all the shops/things need to be consistent and not to be changed all the time.

- Support multi-purpose development, but need to put all things under a main theme.
- How to make it a multi-purpose development?
- No multipurpose development.

Heritage Tourism Development

- For long term development, Hong Kong's development should be led by tourism. The site provides a good location. It should integrate with the nearby areas to make it attractive to tourists.
- Integrate with different concepts. It acts as a very important part of Hong Kong history that makes it very attractive to tourists. For tourism purpose, it can also be very community integrated, e.g. Old Towns in Switzerland and Brussels—Grand Plaza, all can retain the whole integrity and be used for commercial purposes at the same time. It will be more sustainable when it is commercialized.
- Not to use it only for commercial purpose. Tourists are always interested in the Central Police Station which is a historical and cultural building. The use should be for both tourism and heritage preservation.
- There must be a commercial attraction within a good tourism spot. Use some creativity to express the historical elements commercially, e.g. like Singapore or Macau. Also, cultural elements can be highlighted by creative elements and commercial elements.
- In terms of macroscopic view to develop the place, we don't need to limit it for use for Hong Kong. We can make it a tourism attraction for overseas market. Develop it into a visiting place for local people and foreigners.
- For tourism purpose, show the local characteristics/style things is the most important thing.
- For tourism purpose. As a museum about Police Force history, e.g. from colonial characteristics to nowadays, It can also combine with some other cultural elements, e.g. culture exhibition.

Cultural Development

- Not just for pure commercial purpose. It needs to show HK's culture.
- The Hong Kong government encourages creative industry in recent years. It's a good place to let it develop and operate. For example, the jail, it may be difficult to use it for commercial purpose. But if we use it for small businesses like some small workshops for artists, it will be easier to manage, i.e. make use of this site for people working in various industries to communicate and share their ideas.
- Keep it as a historic or preserved architecture. Keep various cultural characteristics in Central and Western district.
- There are a total of 17 buildings in the site. Use it for creative industry e.g. art gallery or art workshops.
- HK should develop a western style performance place. The court can be changed into a performance area, e.g. classical music, dance etc. The most important thing is the theme of all things should match the colonial buildings.
- Show Hong Kong's history and cultural characteristics. As a local recreation area during holiday.
- Like Fringe Club style, e.g. court as a small performance venue/recital or art gallery.

- Should include more recreation and cultural elements but not restaurants/food court.
- Show some local stories of HK's old industries—garment, food, living and transportation, starting at the Central & Western district. Introduce more of Hong Kong's old industries.
- Facilities combining history and culture especially catered for local and overseas visitors.
- The development needs to reflect the history of the site, e.g. judiciary museum, and even classical music performance area.

Museum

- Mainly for showing HK's history and educating the younger generations, but small parts for commercial use is acceptable.
- As a prison museum.
- It is the area where the earliest judiciary establishments of HK were located, and also is the first police station with the first jail in HK with 150 years' of history. It is a very valuable place in HK. Keep the Police, Court and Jail features/history.
- As a museum, but develop into a kind of conference/exhibition area for people coming from different areas, e.g. co-operation conference centre.
- As a museum or light industrial area for art/artists. And the most important thing is to keep the consistency and one complete structure.
- Other museums can be moved here, including museum of correctional services in Stanley, Police museum in the Peak and Transportation museum. Their locations are inconvenient and all transportation facilities do not really reach those places. Moreover, the duty of the police also includes fire fighting and postal service in the old days. So, museums of Hong Kong Fire Services Department and Hong Kong Post can also be considered for the site's good location and convenience—to show the whole of Hong Kong's history.
- As a museum, inclusion of the development of the living environment in the vicinity of the site and history especially the colonial history rather than the mainland Chinese one.
- Can fuse all the characteristics of all museums and maximize the use of the area.
- It has historical value, preserve the decoration and the outlook appearance of the building and use it as a museum.
- As a Japanese war museum or Judiciary System museum. Keep it as a memorial and historical place for the next generations.
- If it is used as a museum, it can be run by government and also by private sector.
- As a unified museum, e.g. Hong Kong history as the main theme, then show all the history of Police Force.
- Let some local companies of long history own some of the space to show their history as they are also part of Hong Kong history.
- As a museum or institute of art/design/film.
- As a museum with an antique trail in Central & Western district. Story-telling can be provided.
- Preserve the site. Move the Marine Police and Police museum there. Show the development of Police Force from the Indian style to the modern style.
- As a judiciary history museum. Let more people know more about HK's judiciary system. Match the place with the cultural context, showing HK's law and justice system and history, reflecting HK as a modern city.

- Preserve the place and show Hong Kong's history. Retired policemen can be asked to work there.
- There are a lot of museums in HK, so it needs to be more interactive as to make it more attractive.
- Make it a living building. If it is used as a museum, it won't be flexible.
- Just very few people go to HK museums which lack liveliness, thus we need to develop the site into something that brings in more energy and spirit.
- Not as a museum.

Commercial Development

- Commercial elements are very important in keeping the sustainability of the site. But need to strike a balance between business and public participation. And heritage and commercial purpose are not mutually exclusive.
- Even with reconstruction in the future, we should keep the historical decoration. Combine the site with commercial elements for increasing the attractiveness of the site. Make it tourism attraction for local and overseas visitors.
- Commercial elements may allow the site to be reborn.
- Being a museum is not the only way to develop a preserved/historic building. If it is going to be a museum, need to keep its quality. Commercial development does not necessarily equal to destroy antiques.
- There are a lot of museums in Hong Kong. Need to find a way to make museums more attractive to both locals and tourists. It should be more commercial thus it can be self-financed. Will be good for the government and not a financial burden to the public. Combining cultural and commercial, e.g. catering, art gallery and mall.
- Have a theme café is better than a general café/restaurant.
- As car park and provide an open café.
- The services/products should not be all at grass root level. It should provide various types of services/products for more choices.
- For the commercial element, not just for consumer activities. Need to keep its sustainability and not for short term development.
- All commercial elements need to match with the history and culture of the site.
- Focus on how to make the place become more valuable. People will consume the products/services that they think worthy. Like café and catering, they can follow a theme to attract people.
- For commercial purpose/elements, do not just focus on making profit. It's important to keep its quality and standard, i.e. upkeep Hong Kong's image.
- Not too commercial.
- It's not good to be too commercial. Commercial elements are just for tourists.
- No commercial elements.
- No commercial developer's domination
- No expensive products/services e.g. high class hotels
- No high end products/services. No high class restaurant.
- Food court would destroy the culture and environment of the site.
- No supermarket, Chinese restaurant, residential area, shopping mall
- No karaoke.
- No chain shops.

- No night clubs, need to keep it peaceful and a good image for tourism. Don't use too much space for cafés inside as it is a valuable place.
- Restaurants/food court should not be a top priority of the future use.

Others

- As a central library, or a private bookstore/book city (laws books).
- It's a valuable place and not necessary to turn it into a recreation centre for public.
- As YMCA/YWCA.
- Provide service/products of more variety, e.g. with small restaurant for local people, attract more people to use the facilities.
- Provide some shops for selling souvenirs. Entrance fee is available for about \$10-\$20. Preserve the history of the site.
- Put the local things like coins, stamps into the site, make it more unique and attractive.
- For education purpose, e.g. invite students to come over here to study and know the history of the site.
- Rent out for short term training program, e.g. for secondary school and some professional institutes.
- Agree with the proposal from Ho Tung's family —as a museum to let public visit.
- If it is used for education purpose, is it the best place for studying art? It is a very valuable site.
- Can provide some activities e.g. 1-day jail trip for teenagers, to show HK's history, the difference between HK's judiciary system and the China one.
- As a place to organize outward bound for youth or retired policemen, and students/participants need to stay there for a few days/certain period of time. It's not for a one day trip area. It will be a good place for educating or learning about discipline, personal potential, community life and judiciary system. Let more people know about the judiciary and disciplinary style of the buildings through the outward bound activities.
- The outward bound activities can be run by the retired policemen through the commercial operation model to lower the cost. The cost fee needs not be very low, and somehow some business organizations may like to sponsor their staff or HK students partly for their participation. That would increase the income of the site.

Themed Development/ Uniqueness

- A unified theme is needed for the whole area's development. Avoid too many individual themes in the site.
- Upkeep a world class quality as a visiting place for tourists to fully enjoy visiting here.
- The decoration of the site needs to be able to reflect on the original use of the place.
- The decoration/shops/theme need to match the history of the building.
- Need to preserve all the artifacts and all the things inside the place and make sure that they will remain unchanged.

- We should enrich the characteristics of the site by adding more related historical things from other means, e.g. public.
- Show the specialty of the buildings, e.g. historical background, colonial history and preserve the valuable buildings as the landmark in Central.
- Have to consider different buildings with different characteristics and constraints.
- In deciding the usage of the site, we need to think deeply on the meaning of different parts of the buildings (i.e. the original one and the parts built afterwards). Show the history and meaning of the change of the buildings in the past.
- Keep the most original purpose/characteristics of different rooms of the buildings, e.g. Court, it had been changed into a police club in the past. It's better to keep its original appearance i.e. Court.
- Preserve the report room which was highly used in the past.
- Preserve both the hardware and software of the site. And may add more software to reinforce the attraction of the site. Also, we should think more on how to increase the content of software of the site.
- With modernize internal decoration/design.
- No deforestation. And need to keep some open area.
- No non-sustainable developmental use.
- No destruction of the whole site.
- Not for packed buildings. No new/modern tall building to be built around the site.

Other Considerations in Determining the Uses and the Design

- Better to put more Western/colonial characteristic things instead of Chinese culture into the site as it tends to be more western style originally.
- Not for reflecting the Chinese based thinking.
- Open the site to public.
- Don't keep it too isolated from the public.
- To be rented out by some organizations. As facilities for public.
- Strike a balance between historical, cultural and commercial aspects. Show its greatest potential for community usage/integration.
- Preserve the about 140-year historical building. It has to be managed by government, avoid from being changed by private organization.
- Government should pay for the running cost of the site at the start, but it needs to be self-sustained financially in the future.
- The way the whole project development is financed e.g. self-financing or to be fully supported by government financially or owned by private sectors, will greatly affect the future use of the site.
- Oppose to the place to be owned by one organization only.
- It's not a 5-year or 10-year project, it's a long term development project. Principle of sustainability is to keep its quality standard.
- In considering the future use of the site, we should not be limited by aspects like financial problem.
- Link the site with SOHO and Lan Kwai Fong to improve the economy of the district.
- Central is a special district. The development and change of SOHO and Lan Kwai Fong is a natural process. The use of CPS actually can be changed and not fixed in the future. Be more flexible.
- Link to the nearby areas. Consider more the impacts on the residents in the district.

Economic VS Social Benefits

General Comments

- Balance the economic and social benefits.
- The importance of social benefits should be placed higher than economic benefits. It's a good place to show HK's history and cultural development and also the HK judiciary system which is good for education.
- Private sectors' participation seems more concerned about the social benefits than the government.
- Social benefits cannot be measured by money/economic returns.
- Education is the first priority for social benefits.
- Making profit is not the purpose of the development of the site.
- For economic benefit, do not just sell the site for making money.
- The project can stimulate the economy of the district.

Economic and Social Consideration

- It is workable for the government to subsidize the development.
- Government should invest in protecting the historic buildings to reach Asia-Pacific/World standard as it facilitates a form of heritage tourism, and the government needs to pay for the maintenance.
- For the whole project, it is very short-sighted if it only focuses on commercial development only. Government should put more effort and money in developing the site into an Asia-Pacific or world class standard cultural development. Thus it can attract a constant number of tourists to HK and it is likely to be a long term development.
- Don't just focus on the commercial elements to maintain the site as costly commercial elements will affect public accessibility. Government needs to finance the site.
- If sustainable development is dependent on commercial investment, there will be a limited return to the public.
- How to prevent the private companies from making huge profit rather than making it a self-sustainable idea?
- The historic buildings should not be passed on to the developers through selling the place as it won't be a long term development.
- Sustainability does not just depend on government, commercial elements can take up part of the responsibility.
- Government does not need to subsidize a lot for operating it, but should not sell the place to make money either.
- For economic benefits, as long as we can meet the requirement and standard of self-financing is good enough so as to minimize government subsidy.
- Self-finance model is not the only way for the site's development.
- By adding the commercial elements, part of the profit of the shops can be used as the maintenance fee/funding and thus minimize funding from tax payer. But the government still needs to subsidize the place.
- Joint efforts between the government and commercial organizations to manage and operate the site. They should seek professional advice and make use of business management experience to manage the site.

- For joint venture, government should work together with non-profit organizations to make sure that it is not focusing on making profit.
- The development of the site can make reference to the development of Ocean Park, i.e. subsidized and managed by the government and some charitable organization like the Jockey Club at the start. Then manage and operate the site by itself.
- It can be subsidized through entrance fee.
- Entrance fee is not enough to cover the finances as a lot of museums in HK are limited in terms of traffic and visitations. Museum is not interactive enough.
- Café and shops just can attract the tourists who visit once on a very superficial basis. Only the intangible HK history can attract tourists to visit many times and thus stay and purchase more in HK.
- Increase the income through tourism, thus improve HK's economy which may in turn increase employment.
- Tourism development for both local and overseas visitors can boost the commercial opportunities nearby.
- Need to renew the whole district. Make the whole site more compatible with Hollywood Road and SOHO area, attract more people to consume as to create more economic benefits.
- The original appearance can be changed for the sake of economic benefits, but need to show people the history/background of the buildings.

Other Comments

- Need to set up a committee for maintenance and management. The committee can be under an individual organization rather than the government.
- Set up a committee to monitor the finance and operation of the site, and the committee should not come from property developers.
- There may be a lot of changes to generate economic benefits. The government should set up a committee including some experts from the architectural sector or other professionals to manage the site.
- How to execute the development is very important.
- Need a clear, detailed and standardized contract and high level of transparency for the tender process.
- Beware of the mistakes, details and the grey area of the contract

Financing Arrangement

Government Subsidization VS Self Financing

- No need for the government to subsidize a lot as to make sure that the original purpose of the site remains unchanged.
- Don't want to give a heavy burden to the government.
- Sustainable development concept is very important. Sustainability can be maintained by a small group or a large group of people. Think about the target group of people that are going to be served while considering the development of the site.
- Self-finance model will be more suitable for a multi-purpose development project as it can attract more different investments and generate income. With such a

project, it can attract more foreign investment/capital and to minimize the conflict between the public and the government.

- Should involve non-profit-making organizations from the public to set up and operate the fund.
- Developers need to maintain/protect the antique themselves, for exhibition purpose to show its history, it should be self-financed by the developers.
- Increase the flexibility of use of funding, with a long term planning on the finance and give more space for developers/organizations to develop.
- Adding commercial elements doesn't mean destruction of heritage.

Government's Role

- Don't just focus on the self-finance model, government can ask some organizations to sponsor for the site. Also the government can set up a fund for the site's development, like heritage trust fund.
- Sustainable development needs to be supported/assured by government, not just limited in the area of capital assistance.
- Government should subsidize/set up a fund at the start, and the fund can then be raised from donations from public or private sectors. When the business starts making profit, put part of it (excluding the tax) on maintenance.
- Government needs to manage and take part of the running cost, may be from funding, donation, to keep the site. Not just depends on self-finance concept.
- Government should pay the maintenance expenditure permanently.
- Ensure that the government can manage the site forever even under tender process to develop the site. For example, the government can rent/sell the place for a certain period of time to one owner only. During the period, the public can still express and reflect their opinions to the owners/developers for improvement. After the period, the government can resume the right to manage the place by itself again.
- Government, public and the developers need to take the responsibility of the financing and need to cooperate with each other.

Other Comments

- The financial model can be operated and managed by both public and private organization.
- Financial income should not be evaluated by a single project, it should be evaluated altogether with the financial effects on the shops and surrounding areas.
- Need to strike a balance between quality and quantity.
- Can use the funding and other forms of funding to support the sustainable development of the site.
- In the tender process, don't just focus on the price for bidding the contract. Need to have clear standards for bidding. Heritage conservation is constantly sacrificed by profit-driven initiatives. The sustainable development concept has to be included in the contract.
- Can the tender standard be set with cultural and commercial considerations?
- Need to think more about the finance situation/income of the site if it is going to be a museum.
- Finance can be supported partly by entrance fee (that is affordable by citizen), and admission during some weekdays should be free, like what the Space Museum

<p>and Science Museum do to increase public visitations.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Self-finance model can be applied for a museum. • As an attractive museum to attract foreigners and people of different ages, thus increase the income of the site. • As a museum with special features that can attract more people and with proper charges for income.
<p>Public Participation</p>
<p>Extent and Scope</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Public should be included in the decision making/planning, evaluation and also operation process. And they should be involved to monitor the whole project. • Public should participate in deciding the usage of the site. • Public can decide on the qualification of people/organization to participate the tender process. • When offering a tender for the site, need to disclose the contract to the public and let the public know the details of the contract. Need to ask for public opinions. • Public can participate in the interior design, architectural design and the content of the tender of the site. • Need to consider more social factors, need to participate and evaluate more. • Public participation should mainly focus on opinion gathering process, this is enough. Public should not be included in the operation process. And prevent the delay of the project by too many opinions. • Public shouldn't participate too much, depends on the purpose of developing the site. • If the public participate too much, it may destroy the development/project. • Don't take too long in deciding the planning and evaluation. Ensure the consultation process is a speedy one thus the project can be completed as soon as possible and not to be delayed for political reasons. • Opinions should be asked within a certain period, with boundary and proper degree.
<p>Ways to Engage the Public</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • How to make sure that the public opinions are included? • Need to educate people before the project starts, thus allow more valuable opinions to be collected. • Public can work together with commercial organizations. • During the opinion gathering process, need to ask for the opinion from the nearby residents actively and let more of them participate in the process. And provide enough ways for people to express their opinion. • Need to consider gathering the opinions from overseas group, e.g. tourism department in other countries. • Invite schools to participate and educate students about the responsibility of being a citizen. • Public should be involved in two areas, management of the site and the decision making area. For management of the site, there are some public representatives in the Legislative Council to reflect their opinions on the development. For making

decision, let more people from the public participate and use the facilities in the site, also, receive their opinions at the same time.

- Let the public participate in different ways, e.g. charette workshop.
- Offer a construction design competition to the public.
- An organization “Hong Kong Antique Council/Committee” should be set up by public for long term operation, as to increase the bargaining power for heritage conservation.
- Set up a heritage conservation council or set up a committee to monitor the place?
- Set up a committee including public, government and developer, for participating in construction, environmental conservation, management and operation of the site.
- There should be a committee to arrange the different parts of uses instead of using law.

Other Comments

- Need to have a public tender.
- Based on the tendering system, if decision on the successful bidder is purely based on price, there is no need for the public to participate. But if we don't evaluate on the price of the contract, what are the measurements for the public to evaluate and operate in the whole project? Is there any organization/department to monitor the operation of the site development?
- It is a valuable historical area that should be focused on education and public areas.
- Strike a balance between cultural preservation and sustainability.
- If the purpose of the site is to be changed, the contract should not be fixed for 50 years. Need to consider who should take the responsibility to monitor the place.
- Government need to gather and unify all the opinions received which are from lots of different areas.